

Resource	Commentator(s)	Testimony	Staff Response
Wheaton Youth Center	Catherine Dodge, Robert Shoenberg, Jason Weidenfeld, Susanne Humphrey, Diana Dubrawksy, Parthenia Purnell, Susan Krasnican, Carol Rawie, Petition of 145 signatures, Joan Rubin (VPres, Wheaton Regional Park Neighborhood Assn), Monica Braden, Patricia Jaramillo, Kathy Carroll, Nuri Funes, Victor Henriquez, Victor Sum, Art Brodsky, Chris Richardson (Chair, County Wide Recreation Advisory Board), MJ Jardeneh (Glenmont Forest Neighbors Civic Assn), Trish Weisman, Colleen Zarzecki, Deborah Dreyfuss, Mark Pharaoh (Chair, East County Recreation Advisory Board), Dan Thompson, John Bogasky, Ray Britch	Oppose historic designation on the basis of one or more of the following:	
		Absolute and complete retention of the entire resource will have a great impact on the design integrity, timing, and cost of new facility, and potentially thwart the project completely. Historic designation would provide no benefit to residents, and would cause unnecessary maintenance costs. The building condition is poor and in need of maintenance. The resource is well beyond the potential usable life of its structure and systems. Renovating the building will require substantial investment. Once a new facility is built, the old one will be empty and devoid of patrons. The facility is too small to serve community needs. The Dept of Recreation provided successful programs in existing facility, and will provide comparable programs in new facility.	Historic designation does not require a building be frozen in time. It also does not preclude redevelopment. Staff recommends the resource be designated on the <i>Master Plan for Historic Preservation</i> with the understanding that the property may be incorporated into redevelopment of the parcel and/or adjoining library parcel. Historic designation of the Wheaton Youth Center will enhance the evolving Wheaton community by providing a richness and rootedness to the built environment. Incorporation of this facility into the program of the new facility would mean less new construction which translates into less money spent on new facility. The savings can be used to rehabilitate the historic resource. In addition, the county would save the cost to demolish the youth center. New programming for the Wheaton Youth Center will mean it is revitalized for new purposes.
		Consultants have found that bringing the building up to LEED standards would be expensive.	As a general rule, any project meeting LEED standards has more upfront costs compared to non-LEED projects. LEED promotes a life-cycle analysis, assessing long-term and environmental impacts, rather than just factoring upfront costs. A project that includes renovation of an existing building can obtain LEED points for building reuse, material reuse, updating lighting, improving air quality or energy use, and site selection.
		The architecture of this resource is not outstanding. Asian influence in architecture and design by Keyes Lethbridge & Condon are not enough justification to merit historic designation.	The Wheaton Youth Center has been found to be National Register eligible by the state preservation office (Maryland Historical Trust), a finding supported by professional expert Isabelle Gournay, PhD, who completed the National Register historic context for Keyes, Lethbridge & Condon resources.
		Concerts cited by the HPC are insufficient basis for designation.	The resource has been found by HPC, staff, and the Maryland Historical Trust to have historic significance

Resource	Commentator(s)	Testimony	Staff Response
			for representing a novel building type—the youth center— designed to serve a newly recognized demographic in the historic context of the postwar era.
		The resource meets less than the nine criteria stated by staff.	A resource needs meet only one criterion to be eligible for historic designation.
		If deemed worthy of remembrance, it would be appropriate to memorialize the youth center with a plaque or documentation according to National Park Service standards, historical displays and activities, and incorporating design elements in new facility, or moved to another site and repurposed for arts programming.	Preservation and reuse of a historic building serves to protect the county’s architectural heritage so that future generations may experience it firsthand, an experience which is not possible with plaques, exhibits or replication.
		If found worthy of designation, an option is to preserve façade while allowing new construction as with the Silver Theater and Shopping Center, and install a historical exhibit.	The redevelopment of the Silver Theater and Shopping Center occurred in conjunction with the Preservation Ordinance since it is a designated historic site. In a similar manner, the proposed Amendment provides guidance for incorporating the resource into the planned new facility.
Wheaton Youth Center	Judith Christensen, (Exec. Director, Montgomery Preservation, Inc.), William Kirwan (Chair, Historic Preservation Commission), Les Hatley, Marcie Stickle (Silver Spring Historical Society), George French, Rona Vazzana, Jeff Krulik, Edith Mahlmann, Petitions of 55 signatures, Joy Mara, Linda Keenan, Mark Willcher	Supports historic designation of the resource on the basis of one or more of the following:	
		HPC unanimously supports designation of this resource. Of all the Park resources under consideration, the HPC finds that the Wheaton Youth Center is particularly worthy of designation.	Staff concurs.
		Has historic significance as a park youth center serving the needs of the emergent postwar youth culture, with performances by national and local bands, in a purposefully designed youth-oriented facility and so meets criteria 1a, 1d of the Preservation Ordinance. The history of the Wheaton Youth Center has meaning as a special place designed for county teenagers, and also for events that took place there.	Staff concurs.
		Distinctive architectural design by a noted architectural firm, the resource has architectural significance, meeting criteria 2a, 2b, and 2c. The resource is a marvel of Asian influenced architecture. The architect, Arthur Keyes, and his firm are highly significant designers. The	Staff concurs.

Resource	Commentator(s)	Testimony	Staff Response
		Wheaton Youth Center project received an AIA award for its design, and was featured in the AIA guide to Washington DC architecture.	
		With creativity and commitment, the resource may be incorporated into a new facility that can meet current needs while preserving local history.	The HPC has recommended that language to this effect be included in the Amendment.
		The Wheaton Youth Center is unique in the county for its architecture and provides a sense of place for Wheaton. The facility has not been well maintained, yet it can be renovated and repurposed.	Staff concurs.  Staff concurs
		Retention of the Wheaton Youth Center is good for the environment. To reuse a building rather than contribute to the landfill supports the sustainability goal of the M-NCPPC and Montgomery County government. The HPC asks that M-NCPPC and the County Dept of General Services work with the HPC to identify and evaluate historic resources as part of the planning process.	Staff concurs.
		It is vital to preserve elements of Wheaton's past so they may continue to be used and experienced. It is one of the last remaining local landmarks. The resource is a local modernist structure that should be preserved to provide diversity in our built environment. With such a unique structure to inspire us, the resource makes the Wheaton community distinct.	Staff concurs.
		Supports preservation and reuse of the Wheaton Youth Center to serve youth of today. Agrees that there is a need for a new facility. With adaptive use, the Wheaton Youth Center could be incorporated into a new facility. This existing resource can be incorporated into new development, following the example of the Silver Theater and Shopping Center.	Staff concurs.
		The building can be restored at a fraction of the cost of destroying it.	Staff is not aware of a study that shows the cost of restoration compared to demolition, but certainly the cost of demolition would be omitted if the building is

Resource	Commentator(s)	Testimony	Staff Response
			restored, and also the cost for constructing a new facility would be less, with programming provided in the existing building.
Stubbs House	Larry Stubbs, Susan Soderberg, Judith Christensen, (Exec. Director, Montgomery Preservation Inc.), William Kirwan (Chair, Historic Preservation Commission), Marcie Stickle (Silver Spring Historical Society), George French	Supports designation of this resource, finding it meets four criteria of the Preservation Ordinance.	The level of change to this building has diminished its ability to convey architectural or historic significance.
		Has historic significance, as a rare pre-Civil War structure in Wheaton. The building represents the evolution of a country estate, being transformed from an 1850 frame farmhouse to a 1950s brick Colonial Revival retreat. The house was a refuge during the Civil War.	
		The house has additional significance in tandem with the Stubbs Barn, the resource forms an important early Wheaton resource.	
		The resource retains its integrity.	The resource had diminished integrity when it was previously evaluated and rejected. This includes encasement in brick, a one-story front addition, removal of bargeboard, and numerous side and rear additions. Its integrity is even lower now, with additional alterations made in the intervening years.
		The building is in prime location for reuse with paved parking area in well-used, publicly visible area. The house is versatile and could be used for a variety of purposes.	The issue of building use is outside the historic designation consideration.
		Though previously evaluated, the research formerly presented was incomplete.	Historic preservation staff has had a general practice of not recommending designation of resources that have previously been evaluated and were rejected for historic designations. Exceptions to this rule have Falkland Apartments and Wild Acres which were found to be properties with great and undisputed historic and/or architectural significance. Even with additional submitted research, staff does not find the Stubbs House to be in this category.
		According to Parks Maintenance staff, the house is sound and sturdy.	The resource has diminished regardless of the structural condition of the building. The Parks Department has submitted an assessment of condition

Resource	Commentator(s)	Testimony	Staff Response
Five recreation centers	Judith Christensen, (Exec. Director, Montgomery Preservation Inc.), William Kirwan (Chair, Historic Preservation Commission), Marcie Stickle (Silver Spring Historical Society), George French	All five recreation centers merit historic designation on the Master Plan for Historic Preservation.	(see attached). Staff concurs
Rock Creek Rec Center	Judy Koenig	Supports designation of this resource. Has recommendations for Parks Dept about silt removal from park flooding.	Staff concurs. The issue of silt removal is beyond historic designation consideration. Staff defers to the Parks Department for park maintenance issues.
All resources	Mark Pharaoh (Chair, East County Recreation Advisory Board)	Questions the value of the historic preservation program. Expresses concerns about negative impact historic designation might have on future plans for new public facilities. Suggests the county adopt the practice of waiting to evaluate a property for historic designation until a project is proposed so public benefits may be adequately considered, and suggests the County Council study the possibility of making it more difficult to designate buildings as historic sites.	The county council enacted a preservation program in 1979 in response to concerns about the rapid loss of historic resources through development at a time when there was no method to incorporating their protection into the planning process. The designation process provides an opportunity to balance public interests while protecting the county's heritage. Historic designation does not preclude new construction. A case in point is Strathmore Hall. The historic designation of the mansion house did not prevent construction of the Strathmore performing arts center.