

## ***Appendix A: Outreach and Engagement***

Many stakeholders are involved with and impacted by loading and delivery operations, including business owners, residents, building tenants, customers, visitors, and numerous government agencies. Over the course of this study, robust targeted outreach identified issues and brainstormed potential solutions. Outlined below is the full list of the diverse group of stakeholders that were engaged during this process. As the potential options identified in this Study are considered for implementation, continued coordination with stakeholders will be critical to find workable solutions appropriate to specific streets throughout the County.

### **Stakeholders**

#### **1. Public Agencies**

- a. Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services Right-of-Way
- b. Montgomery County Department of Transportation – Development Review
- c. Montgomery County Department of Transportation – Parking
- d. Montgomery County Police Department, 2nd District (Bethesda)
- e. Bethesda-Chevy Chase Regional Service Center
- f. Maryland Department of Transportation State Highway Administration

#### **2. Members of the Community**

- a. Bethesda Downtown Implementation Advisory Committee (IAC)
- b. Bethesda Urban Partnership (BUP)
- c. Bethesda Transportation Demand Management District Advisory Committee
- d. Greater Bethesda Chamber of Commerce – Real Estate Committee

#### **3. Private Sector**

- a. Bozzuto Property Management – The Flats at Bethesda Avenue
- b. Bozzuto Property Management – 8300 Wisconsin Avenue
- c. DHL International Shipping
- d. FedEx Express
- e. Amazon

Bethesda Downtown Implementation Advisory Committee (IAC)  
**December 4, 2020**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Leslye Howerton

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to the committee and solicited feedback from the committee.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. The goals of improving pedestrian and bicycle safety, as well as working toward Vision Zero practices is more important than the through-movement of vehicles.
  2. Site design and enforcement are critical components of addressing the issues presented by urban loading.
  3. Loading issues, as described in the scope of work presentation are present in every urban area across the country.
  4. Third party delivery vehicles (peapod, amazon, etc.) and contractors seem to be the most frequent offenders. These two entities are not controlled or scheduled by property managers.
    - a) No matter how welcoming the loading dock, large numbers of deliveries (food, Uber, Amazon, etc.) will never use the loading dock.
    - b) In order to get compliance with these groups, property managers need buy-in or penalties for retailers and tenants.
    - c) Enforcement should be stepped-up by the Police – participants noted stringent enforcement in the District of Columbia, but not Bethesda.
  5. Two-way separated bicycle lanes are confusing for drivers.
  6. Lay-by seem to be a good solution for short term deliveries, given a context sensitive approach (i.e. the lay-by does not cross the sidewalk or bikeway).
  7. deliveries should be scheduled during the early morning or overnight hours when traffic and pedestrian/ bicycle activity is lowest.
  8. The committee expressed appreciation for Planning Staff evaluating this issue.

Bethesda Urban Partnership  
**December 10, 2020**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Leslye Howerton, Iftin Thompson  
Attendees: Jeff Burton, Executive Director, BUP

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to BUP Staff and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. Any recommendations pertaining to police enforcement actions deserve careful consideration and should keep in mind negative implications associated with enforcement on businesses. Recommendations should recognize limitations of enforcement.
  2. BUP Staff noted that although Planning Staff identified 8300 Wisconsin (the Harris Teeter) as a site that has loading issues, there are elements of that project that work. The site's Battery Lane frontage doesn't work, however, the Woodmont Avenue frontage does work. Issues on this site could be addressed by "no standing" on Battery Lane and by limiting deliveries to off-peak (non-peak) times.
  3. BUP Staff identified areas with known issues:
    1. Woodmont Avenue/ Bethesda Avenue at the Darcy (CCT pull off); issues at this site occur throughout the day.
    2. Miller Lane, along the north side of the street, due to shipping associated with the printing business along that block.
    3. Bethesda Avenue between Arlington Road and Woodmont Avenue
    4. Arlington Road
      - a. Car carriers associated with Euro Motorcars have been a long-standing issue on Arlington Road.
      - b. Car carriers could become more of an issue with Oursman's recent expansion. Oursman typically uses the curb lane of Montgomery Avenue between Woodmont Avenue and East Lane.
    5. Woodmont Triangle
      - a. Cordell Avenue has the highest incidence of loading issues in Woodmont Triangle; issues mostly occur in the morning.
      - b. Woodmont Triangle loading issues are often related to the concentration of restaurants, which have high mid-day patron demand that coincide with food/ alcohol deliveries.
      - c. In practice, delivery vehicles double-park within Woodmont Triangle because there is no where to pull off and many of the businesses are too small to have their own loading areas.

6. South Bethesda
  - a. Southbound Wisconsin Avenue near the Adagio (6000 - 7000 Block of Wisconsin Avenue) was formerly a problem, however, MD SHA removed parking meters along this block and replaced with “no standing” signs, which solved the problem along Wisconsin Avenue but may have pushed delivery activities to the alley, on the west side of the block, or onto Bradley Boulevard.
7. Pandemic conditions
  - a. BUP Staff have identified fewer loading issues during the COVID-19 Pandemic due to Less competition for curb lane space, lower volume of sales due to decreased in-person business and lower traffic volumes.
  - b. BUP and MCDOT have implemented curbside pick-up zones and expanded outdoor dining areas to support businesses.
    - i. It is not yet clear which (if any) of these temporary measures may remain once Pandemic restrictions are lifted and activities return to pre-Pandemic levels.
8. Additional comments:
  - a. BUP Staff identified sites with effective loading operations:
    - i. Bethesda Crossing (layby)
    - ii. Flats 8300 Wisconsin Avenue (no standing anytime signs)
9. Potential Considerations
  - a. Create common loading zones for deliveries and push both education and enforcement.
  - b. Potential pilots:
    - i. Consolidated loading zones
    - ii. Loading Zone signage (rather than “No Parking” signs)

Montgomery County Department of Transportation  
**December 11, 2020**

Staff: Iftin Thompson, Matthew Folden, and Leslye Howerton  
Attendees: Andrew Bossi, MCDOT – Director’s Office; Alexander Deley, MCDOT – Parking,  
Benjamin Morgan, MCDOT – Parking

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to MCDOT Staff and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. MCDOT asked how the study will address conditions present during the COVID-19 Pandemic? Planning Staff explained that the study will evaluate conditions during both the Pandemic and pre-Pandemic (typical) periods in anticipation of a future return to normalcy.
  2. MCDOT asked Planning Staff to clarify the scope and deliverable of the study. Planning Staff explained that the study is focused primarily on overall loading operations in downtown Bethesda and to a lesser extent concerned with uber/door dash and “quick deliveries.” The deliverable of the study will be to
    - a) Define problems with Loading in downtown Bethesda
    - b) Identify policy guidance on best practices around the United States and Europe
    - c) Identify potential changes to the County Code to address issues
    - d) Identify potential pilot projects in Bethesda to address common loading needs.
  3. MCDOT staff suggested giving greater consideration of quick-turnaround freight (ridehail, meal deliveries, grocery deliveries, parcel deliveries) as the study may find that these are extremely interrelated with curbside freight.
  4. MCDOT Parking Staff explained that the Achilles heel of loading in Downtown is larger trucks standing in the curbside travel lane and asked that the study evaluate why trucks are not using internal loading docks.
  5. MCDOT staff identified the following issues:
    1. Streets within the Woodmont Triangle (Norfolk Avenue, Cordell Avenue, and Woodmont Avenue) have issues handling large trucks. Smaller trucks seem to be accommodated downtown with larger vehicles presenting the biggest issues.
- MCDOT Staff acknowledged that in certain circumstances, lay-bys may make sense, however, lay-bys should typically be avoided due to negative impacts to pedestrians and potential traffic safety considerations. Lay-by should only be considered on a case-by-case basis.

## 1. Current Practices

- a) Temporary curbside pickup signs/ areas that have been implemented as part of the COVID-19 Pandemic will need to be evaluated once travel demand and activity in Bethesda return to normal.
- b) Since the beginning of the Pandemic, MCDOT Parking has installed approximately 50 signs in Bethesda and will continue to put new signs in high demand places.
- c) Regulatory signage within the PLD provides “no standing,” “no stopping,” (AM/PM rush hour) and “no parking signs” throughout Bethesda
- d) Rather than assign loading zones, Parking has typically signed “no parking” zones and permitted loading.
  - a) R-73 Loading sign might be an option to help improve communication of where loading is permitted (no parking may not adequately convey the intent of the open zone)
    - o Alternatively, a supplemental placard could help
    - o Parking Division established curbside pick-up zones for the Pandemic
  - b) Bethesda on-street parking restrictions begin at 9:00 AM, so lots of loading takes place during that time.
    - o This is also to encourage loading deliveries early in the morning, however, some loading still takes place after 9 am

## 2. Considerations

- a) MCDOT Parking Division maintains data for garage utilization but not for on-street curbside parking utilization.
- b) Less on-street curbside parking means a reduction in County parking revenue.
- c) Lower parking requirements means fewer ADA accessible spaces and potentially more need for MCDOT to provide ADA accessible spaces.
- d) Coordinate with the District of Columbia Department of Transportation (DDOT) as that agency is currently undertaking a similar loading study.

Ms. Laura MacNeil, DDOT Freight & Urban Delivery Planner

  - Look into peer jurisdictions, such as: Fairfax, VA; Arlington, VA; Seattle/ King County, WA.
- e) Potential pilots:
  - b. Consolidated loading zones on streets within the Woodmont Triangle or other areas of Bethesda, as needed.
  - c. Loading Zone signage (rather than “No Parking” signs)

Montgomery County Police Department, 2<sup>nd</sup> District (Bethesda)  
**December 18, 2020**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Iftin Thompson  
Attendees: Assistant Chief of Police – Patrol Willie Parker-Loan, 2<sup>nd</sup> District Commander  
Sean Gagen, 2<sup>nd</sup> District Deputy Commander Lt. John D’Albora, Sgt. Thomas Curtis

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to 2<sup>nd</sup> District Police Officers and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. 2<sup>nd</sup> District Police Officers acknowledged concerns with loading activities and said staff at the 2<sup>nd</sup> district receive complaints related to loading operations on a weekly basis. Complaints are typically from residents and patrons of businesses within downtown and not necessarily from property managers. The following were identified as known issues:
    1. Issues are typically observed between 9:00 AM and noon
    2. Blocked Sidewalks
    3. Occupying curb lanes
    4. Taking available parking
    5. Biggest offenders:
      - Cisco deliveries
      - Delivery trucks
      - Uber/ Lyft/ Door Dash/ Amazon sub-contractors, etc. – The drivers are individuals and will park wherever its convenient for them.
    6. Specific Streets/ Areas:
      - Bethesda Avenue
      - Elm Street
      - Woodmont Triangle
        - Cordell Avenue from Woodmont Avenue to Old Georgetown Road (more specifically from Dr. Schlobohm’s Dentist office to California Tortilla)
      - Areas along Wisconsin Avenue (MD 355) due to on-going construction
      - 8300 Wisconsin Avenue (Harris Teeter)
      - Arlington Blvd (EuroMotor Cars dealership)
      - Woodmont Avenue/ Bethesda Avenue (Silver Condominium)
  - Examples of Good Loading Operations:
    - BF Saul (7501 Wisconsin Avenue) does a good job loading because the loading is around the back off East West highway – The Police do not receive complaints about loading on this property.
    - 7272 Wisconsin loading service area that is under construction (head-in/ Head-out) and an internal loading area is promising.

- Considerations:
  - Curbside loading spaces that have been put into place during the pandemic have been helpful in solving some loading issues and have alleviated double-parking by USPS and smaller delivery vehicles.
  
- Additional comments:
  - Commander Sean Gagen would like to participate in future outreach meetings and be involved with the study. Cmdr. Gagen can be reached at 240-876-6828 and [Sean.Gagen@montgomerycountymd.gov](mailto:Sean.Gagen@montgomerycountymd.gov)
  - Get buy-in from the business community. Property management companies should be considered a force multiplier in reaching compliance.
  - Engineering and education strategies should always be the first choice. Enforcement efforts are limited and have negative consequences. Enforcement tends to be limited because the delivery drivers park where they need to park to get the job done.
    - A \$35 parking ticket does not have the teeth necessary to change the behavior of professional delivery drivers. The study could evaluate opportunities to increase the County penalty amounts for repeat offenders or non-compliance. This guidance would need to come from the County Council.
    - Potential pilot programs:
      1. A potential pilot program could include an education campaign through parking enforcement officers.
        - Parking enforcement officers have been told (by drivers) that drivers were instructed to grab the ticket and pay it – that the cost of a ticket was built into the process.
        - Officers are faced with turnover of drivers. Once the drivers are educated, the drivers change, and the officers are faced with the original issues.
        - Parking enforcement officers could hand out educational materials in lieu of tickets (or with tickets) to improve education and increase compliance.
        - This approach could include a partnership with the Bethesda Chamber of Commerce
      2. Installation of “Loading” signs, rather than “no parking” signs, would help officers with enforcement efforts and communicate common loading areas.
        - Include specific time of day – early morning, late evening, midday



Bethesda/Chevy Chase Regional Service Center

**January 19, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Iftin Thompson  
Attendees: Ken Hartman, Director; Derrick Harrigan, Urban Services Manager, Cmdr. Sean Gagen, 2<sup>nd</sup> District Police

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to Bethesda Regional Services Staff and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. Regional Services Staff identified the following issues:
    - a) Lunchtime (11:00 AM – 1:00 PM) deliveries coincide with mid-day peak travel, particularly in the Woodmont Triangle and Bethesda Avenue.
    - b) Rush hour loading/ unloading (particularly construction) causes issues
    - c) Regional Services and BUP previously tried to work with restaurants to coordinate loading areas, however, that work was never implemented due to the COVID-19 Pandemic.
    - d) Loading docks are too small to accommodate the trucks that show up
    - e) Delivery trucks stop within the on-street bike lanes.
    - f) Specific Streets/ Areas of known problems:
      - a) Woodmont Triangle
    - g) Specific Streets/ Areas with good loading operations
      - a) Bethesda Row is good because of the alley set-up, except where Bethesda Lane comes into Bethesda Avenue because people pull up onto the apron for short term deliveries.
    - h) Regional Services staff suggested the following be considered to more effectively manage curbside deliveries:
      - a) Designating hours of loading to limit peak period disruption?
      - b) Working with the police to close the loop on enforcement
      - c) Designating loading space through the use of “no parking signs” or loading zone signs
      - d) Alleys and laybys can possibly reduce some of the issues
      - e) Designating pull through areas for loading at buildings
    - f) Considerations
      - The inter-city buses (Bolt, Mega Bus, Vamoose, etc) are currently on Waverly Avenue but should be on North Lane/ East Lane or in the Bethesda Metro Station bus area
        - Evaluate how New York City manages these buses and earns revenue (for renting curbspace)
      - Curbside pick-up zones implemented in response to the COVID-19 Pandemic have been great for managing demand. It’s too early to tell if this could be made permanent given other demands for curb lanes and revenue projections for on-street parking.

Montgomery County Department of Permitting Services Right-of-Way  
**January 22, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Iftin Thompson, Leslye Howerton  
Attendees: Atiq Panjshiri, Sam Farhadi, Yee-mei Tse, Cmdr. Sean Gagen

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to DPS Right-of-Way Staff and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. DPS ROW Staff were supportive of the study's approach and encouraged staff to consider the potential for:
    - a) Time of day restrictions for loading to limit peak period traffic disruptions,
    - b) Context sensitive design solutions for lay-by's (on a case-by-case basis) to handle curbside delivery management,
    - c) Opportunities for consolidated loading activities on development sites, including large and small deliveries and both scheduled and unscheduled deliveries.
    - d) Design loading for large trucks not just small trucks
  - e) DPS ROW Staff suggested that the study compare loading standards set forth in the 2014 Zoning Ordinance with those that were previously in place under the 2004 Ordinance. DPS clarified that prior to adoption of the 2014 Ordinance, DPS was the agency charged with reviewing and approving loading vehicle size and design. DPS further clarified that the Zoning Ordinance loading requirements and Planning Board approval authority was the specific guidance of the County Council during the Zoning Ordinance rewrite process.
  - f) DPS ROW Staff identified small deliveries, like Amazon, UPS, and Fedex, as particularly problematic.
  - g) DPS ROW offered the following considerations on the potential for increased use of lay-bys (as suggested by other stakeholder groups):
    - a) Lay-bys should only be considered on a case-by-case basis. Although a lay-by would help truck operations, this design element creates the potential for increased conflicts between pedestrians and vehicles, narrows urban sidewalks, and requires space that is often better allocated in the urban environment.

Greater Bethesda Chamber of Commerce – Real Estate Committee  
**January 27, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Leslye Howerton

Attendees:

Allie Williams, President & CEO GBCC; Ginanne M. Italiano, Director of Legislative Affairs, GBCC

Jack Alexander, AMR Commercial; John Bowis, Chevy Chase Automotive; Francoise Carrier, Bregman, Berbert, Schwartz & Gilday; Joe Chirico, John Marshall Bank; Stacey Cole, Long and Foster; Ellen Coren, Chesapeake Public Strategies; David Dennison, The Original Pancake House; Heather Dlhopsky, Wire Gill; Tim Eden, Starr Capital; Matthew Gordon, Selzer Gurvitch; Chuck Kaufman, Vamoose Bus; Lawrence Kotchek, Print 1; Russell Lacey, Electrical Advisors; Anabel Quintero, MV Financial; Andy Shulman TDG/ Silver Rock Realty; Mickie Simpson, TTR Sotheby Real Estate; Hill Slowinski, Long & Foster; Gary Unterberg, Rodgers Consulting

Jeff Burton, Executive Director, BUP; Kristin Blackmon, Director Bethesda Transportation Solutions/ BUP; Susanna Parker, Special Projects Manager, BUP; Peggy Schwartz, North Bethesda Transportation Management District; Cmdr. Sean Gagen, 2<sup>nd</sup> District Montgomery County Police Department

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to the Bethesda Chamber of Commerce Real Estate Committee and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. Staff clarified that the study is not a sector plan and would therefore not follow the public testimony and hearing schedule observed for sector plans. Staff further clarified that the intent of the document was to identify best practices for urban loading and curbside management.
  2. Planning Staff will coordinate with the Chamber to present preliminary findings in spring 2021 as part of the study's Phase II outreach component.
  3. Committee members asked if the study would focus on existing issues or new development.
    - a) Staff explained that the study would evaluate both existing issues and new strategies that could be considered within the context of new development applications.
  4. Committee members asked if there might be concessions within the streetscape standards (such as eliminating street trees) to accommodate space for loading vehicles.
    - a) Staff responded by acknowledging that there are many competing elements within the streetscape, such as tree panels, wider sidewalks, and furnishing zones, that contribute to the quality of the pedestrian environment. It is the intent of the study to maintain a high quality streetscape while balancing loading needs.

5. Committee members expressed concern with the installation of new separated bicycle facilities that eliminate parking and curbside lanes as reductions to those elements negatively impact adjacent businesses.
6. Committee members asked how COVID-19 Pandemic measures, such as street closures for expanded outdoor dining and curbside pick-up zones, have been working (with regard to loading and emergency access) and whether those measures would exist once things return to normal following the Pandemic.
  - a) Jeff Burton, BUP, and Cmdr. Gagen, MCPD, responded that emergency agencies have been part of the planning efforts and that standards, such as 11-foot wide travel lanes, have been maintained where needed to accommodate access.
  - b) Staff clarified that it is unclear at this point which Pandemic measures would remain once things return to normal, however, the study would discuss these elements as potential strategies for future consideration.

District of Columbia Department of Transportation  
Planning and Sustainability Division  
**February 9, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Iftin Thompson, Leslye Howerton  
Attendees: Laura MacNeil, Freight & Urban Delivery Planner

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to DDOT Staff and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  - a) DDOT's experience with curbside management pilot projects
    - a) Accommodating loading along frontages with separated/ protected bike lanes. This can be accommodated on some streets through the use of a wide buffer between the bike lane and general purpose travel lanes. This type of loading zone should be implemented near driveways, alleyways, or building loading areas. Considerations include the amount of space necessary for loading activities and room for the driver to enter and exit the vehicle safely.
    - b) DDOT worked with technology company CurbFlow on a curbside management pilot study in 2019. Although the pilot gave DDOT lots of good information about who was using the curb and for how long, the pilot was labor intensive and not scalable for DDOT's purposes.
    - c) DDOT uses pick-up/ drop-off (PUDO) zones throughout the District. These were initially for ride hailing but have expanded to serve food delivery/ contactless pick-up.
    - d) DDOT has a monthly interagency meeting for police, parking enforcement, and DDOT staff to identify what is working and what additional steps need to be taken to accommodate curbside demand. This allows staff to highlight safety concerns, concentrate educational campaigns, and coordinate new programs.
    - e) DDOT does not have a standard practice for requiring handtruck/ cart delivery for the "last block" portion of the trip, however, there is interest in implementing and incentivizing e-cargo bike/ micro-hub/ staging area
  - b) Technology/ Smart Curbs
    - a) DDOT is working on rolling out a plate-based permit system to streamline the commercial vehicle loading passes. Can work out access privileges and pricing based on use/ tracking.
    - b) Automated/ driverless technology use is not widespread at this time, however, experimental meal delivery robots use public sidewalks and Ford is doing driverless vehicle tests on public streets in the district.
  - c) Issues:
    - a) Off peak loading can be problematic due to increased noise at night, business staffing constraints (especially with regard to alcohol deliveries), "off-peak" for commuters can be peak for neighborhood nightlife.

- b) Curbside demand is high for scooters, dockless bicycles, ADA access, deliveries/ pick-up, and other uses. Constant assessment of whether the infrastructure is up to the task.
  
- d) Curbside Management in other jurisdictions:
  - a) Seattle, Washington and the Urban Freight Lab
  - b) Bellevue, Washington
  - c) Columbus, Ohio use of camera-based curbside management through the technology company CurbFlow.
  - d) Boston, Massachusetts use of E- Cargo Bikes
  - e) New York City use of E- Cargo Bikes
  - f) Aspen, Colorado use of gps-based curb reservation technology through the technology company Coord.
  - g) Washington, DC Wharf delivery management strategy
  
- e) Further Coordination Considerations:
  - a) Maryland Department of Transportation, Maryland State Freight Advisory Committee

Bozzuto Property Management – The Flats at Bethesda Avenue  
**February 12, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Iftin Thompson, Leslye Howerton  
Attendees: Christopher Gibson, Property Manager, Bozzuto

Discussion:

- Background:
  1. Mr. Gibson is the Property Manager for the Flats at Bethesda Avenue (7170 Woodmont Ave, Bethesda, MD 20815), a mixed-use building with 162 residential dwelling units and ground floor retail.
  2. Bozzuto Property Management manages over 80,000 residential units and 2.7 million square feet of retail in 12 different states.
- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to Mr. Gibson and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. Known issues at this location:
    - a) COVID-19 curbside pick-up for Pottery barn in front of the loading dock sometimes causes passenger vehicles to block the sidewalk
    - b) A “perfect storm” occurs when deliveries for the ground floor restaurant coincide with resident move-in/ move-out and trash service. In this case, the property manager typically serves as traffic cop to keep things moving and clear the sidewalk.
    - c) Occasionally, trucks are too large to be accommodated in the loading dock (or the driver is unwilling to use the loading dock), resulting in curbside loading or blocking the sidewalk.
  2. Mr. Gibson’s experiences with loading as a property manager:
    - a) The property manager takes a proactive role in keeping trucks from blocking the sidewalk. Loading vehicles that block the sidewalk create a safety issue and they also diminish the outdoor dining experience for the ground floor restaurant.
      - a) When an issue occurs, the property manager speaks with the manager on duty (for the commercial tenant). If the problem persists, the property manager can elevate to Bozzuto’s corporate leasing office for action.
    - b) Resident move-in/ move-out
      - a) Building residents use an amenity reservation system to schedule move-in/ move-out in two hour increments:
        - Move-in/ move-out reservations are scheduled on weekdays from 7:00 AM – 11:30 AM and again from 2:00 PM to 6:00 PM.
        - No move-in/ move-out reservations are scheduled during the 11:30 AM – 2:00 PM period to permit time for trash and other deliveries to occur.
      - c) Commercial Deliveries
        - a) One of the ground floor tenants scheduled deliveries in the early morning in order to be able to pull up to the curb and

unload, however, this created noise issues with the residential component of the building and was discontinued.

- d) Mail/ Parcel Delivery
    - a) The mail delivery driver calls ahead to the building concierge so the loading door can be open when the driver arrives.
    - b) FedEx and Amazon drivers switch routes too often to be routine users of the loading dock.
  - e) Food Delivery
    - a) Food delivery is too individualized to be managed. These deliveries typically pull up on the curb.
  - f) Trash:
    - a) Based on the size of the building and the number of commercial tenants, trash service comes to the Flats at least three times per week (typically on Mondays, Wednesdays, and Fridays). Although there is a standing day, the truck is accommodated whenever it arrives.
    - b) Trash pick-up takes approximately 5 minutes with the driver and one helper. The driver calls ahead to the building concierge so the loading door can be open when the driver arrives.
      - o The helper pushes the dumpster to the street where the truck is waiting and then returns the dumpster to the loading bay.
3. How loading design/ operations can be improved in the future:
- a) More loading areas on public streets or common locations
  - b) Quick loading/ unloading spaces in County-owned garages
  - c) New developments should be planned with parcel lockers/ adequate storage space for parcel deliveries. This is a critical part of the residential lobby.
  - d) New developments should be planned with “pull through” loading spaces.
  - e) Having a callbox at the loading dock is a helpful way to increase usage of the dock.
  - f) Stricter enforcement or higher fines to encourage compliance.



Montgomery Planning Equity Peer Review  
**February 16, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Leslye Howerton, Iftin Thompson, Elza Hisel-McCoy  
Attendees: Khalid Afzal, Delisa Coleman, Brian Crane, Darrell Godfrey, Elwyn Gonzalez, Tamika Graham, Molline Jackson, Matt Mills, Melissa Williams, and Pamela Zorich.

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to BUP Staff and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points on how to address equity raised during the meeting included:
  1. An acknowledgement that the study is considering a diversity of perspectives through the use of targeted engagement of Bethesda-area stakeholders.
  2. Emphasis on considerations of elderly/ disabled individuals. Maybe include demographics of the elderly population in Bethesda
  3. Consideration of how small/ minority owned/ disadvantaged businesses might be impacted by any recommendations of the study and any costs to those businesses resulting from study recommendations.
  4. Consideration of how idling vehicles may negatively impact air quality
  5. Consideration of noise impacts associated with off-peak (nighttime) deliveries
  6. Consideration of reduced visibility with off-peak (nighttime) deliveries
  7. Technology
  8. The study could consider how educational tools could be used to inform the community about safe loading practices.
  9. Consider including citation data from enforcement to determine biggest offenders in Bethesda

Montgomery County Department of Transportation –  
Development Review  
**March 2, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Iftin Thompson, Leslye Howerton  
Attendees: Andrew Bossi, Brenda Pardo, Deepak Somarajan, Rebecca Torma, Billy Whelan

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to MCDOT Development Review Staff and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. DPS ROW Staff were supportive of the study's approach and encouraged staff to consider the potential for:
    - a) Context sensitive design solutions for lay-by's (on a case-by-case basis) to handle curbside delivery management,
    - b) Design loading for large trucks not just small trucks,
    - c) Common loading spaces,
    - d) Conflicts between bicycle facilities and loading operations
    - e) Loss of street parking for areas dedicated to loading operations
    - f) Time of day restrictions on loading to alleviate negative impacts to adjacent street traffic.
  - MCDOT Development Review Staff suggested that if the study recommends the use of "loading zone" type signage, MCDOT have the opportunity to comment on the recommendation.

## DHL International Shipping

**March 4, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Leslye Howerton, Iftin Thompson  
Attendees: Bruce Marsh, Director, Corporate Public Affairs, DP-DHL Americas

### Discussion:

- Background:
  1. Mr. Marsh is the Director of Corporate Public Affairs for DP-DHL Americas.
  2. DP-DHL Americas has approximately 50,000 employees in the United States with a growing market share in the Washington, DC region. The firm primarily focuses on international delivery and as a result, approximately 80% of DHL's business is with small- to mid-sizes enterprises.
  3. The main distribution center in the region is in the Brentwood neighborhood of D.C.
  4. DHL operates under an independent-contractor model under which local contractors provide (teamsters union) delivery drivers in DHL-branded vehicles.
- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to Mr. Marsh and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. How DHL is taking pressure off the curb
    - a) In international markets, DHL operates over 5,000 parcel locker sites. These lockers are located in areas of high population density, such as transit stations, and have been very successful because it's convenient for customers and efficient for parcel delivery.
    - b) Installation of "pop up" DHL retail storefronts, one of which is located at the Westfield Wheaton Mall. (Press Release: <https://www.dhl.com/us-en/home/press/press-archive/2020/dhl-opens-first-of-its-kind-mobile-pop-up-store.html>). Some of these pop up locations are solar powered and mobile and can be placed where demand is present.
    - c) In international markets, DHL uses cargo bikes for last mile delivery. The company has over 27,000 bike delivery routes in Germany. Domestically, DHL is beginning to offer bike delivery in New York City and Miami.
      - a) The company is willing to consider use of cargo bikes where sufficient pick-up/ delivery density and bike infrastructure exist and subject to union negotiations for the region.
  2. Sustainability
    - a) DHL is in the early stages of electrifying its delivery vehicle fleet and has set a goal to be net zero by 2050.
    - b) Route optimization technology is making routes more efficient when considering both a time and fuel.
  3. Technology

- a) Other jurisdictions, including Washington, D.C., have had mixed success with smart mobility apps but these require widespread use and buy-in.
  - b) The industry has experimented with drones/ autonomous vehicles in China and Washington, D.C. and has found that these applications have very limited benefit at this time. These technologies are expected to play a role in the future, but are not yet ready for widespread use.
4. How has the Pandemic affected delivery operations?
- a) Higher package volume
    - a) Historically, operations have been primarily “business-to-business.” This model is increasingly shifting to “business-to-consumer” during the Pandemic and ecommerce boom.
    - b) Residential package delivery costs more (per package) than business package delivery because the delivery points are more dispersed.
  - b) Waiver of signatures upon delivery (to promote social distancing) has made deliveries more efficient and reduced time spent at each location.
  - c) Expanded café seating and road closures (to expand public spaces and promote social distancing) and expanded mobile pick-up spaces have made it more difficult to find parking and increased distances between the truck and delivery locations.
5. What practices in other jurisdictions have been successful in managing delivery access?
- a) Reallocation of a small portion of the ground floor of underutilized parking garages to serve as micro-distribution hubs. These arrangements provide a revenue stream to the local jurisdiction and improve efficiency by placing delivery companies in areas close to service demand.
    - a) Example: REEF Parking Management, Miami Fl  
<https://www.globaltrailerlog.com/2020/05/18/dhl-and-reef-technology-pilot-rytle/>
  - b) Downtown Santa Monica “Zero Emissions Delivery Zone,” which seeks to test a number of innovations within the area, aimed at helping to reduce pollution, create local green jobs and improve quality of life, including: electric micromobility solutions, medium and light-duty e-delivery vehicles for goods, and "first-in-the-nation" commercial medium-duty electric truck-sharing and charging available for small businesses.
6. How local government can support delivery operations
- a) Designated delivery zones would be helpful
  - b) Building/ site design should consider delivery needs, including: places for delivery vehicles to park, centralized parcel lockers, parcel storage, etc.)
  - c) As planners rethink streetscapes and curb allocation, don’t forget to plan for and accommodate delivery vehicles.



International shipping company, DHL Express, is partnering with North American logistics hub operator, REEF Technology, to pilot the use of new RYTLE electric-assist e-Cargo MOVRs for deliveries across Miami.

Source: <https://www.globaltrailer.com/2020/05/18/dhl-and-reef-technology-pilot-rytle/>

# DHL Popup ServicePoint Overview



## Services Provided

- DHL international shipping services provided to consumers via window or in store. Popups are positioned in well-lit shopping centers, in non-congested areas



## Structure:

- Steel-framed structure built on a DOT approved hydraulic steel commercial trailer with ability to lower almost flush to the ground. Platform measures 8.5' wide, 16' long + 4.5' for tong. Stamped drawings provided



## Floor Plan:

- Floor plan of the trailers is approximately 140 square feet and has an interior usable space of 97 square feet



## Power:

- 2 20-amp outlets hook up to the exterior of the unit to provide continuous power for lighting, alternative solar/batter model available in some markets



## Accessibility:

- Wheel chair ramp available and personal concierge service provided as requested



## Safety:

- Only one customer allowed inside at a time due to social distancing. Masks required at all times



## Security:

- Includes alarm system, fish eye camera, panic button, Security cabinet for all packages

FedEx Express  
**March 4, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Iftin Thompson  
Attendees: Dean Hinkle, Senior Manager FedEx Express Gaithersburg, MD,  
Emily Middlekauff, Operations Manager, FedEx Express Gaithersburg, MD

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation to Mr. Hinkle and Ms. Middlekauff and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. Delivery Challenges in Bethesda
    - a) The biggest challenges facing delivery operations in Bethesda is the competition for curb space, given the desire to be as close to the final point of delivery as possible, and consumer expectations for timely delivery.
    - b) Curbside parking is always a challenge due to the size of the vehicles and the need for pedestrian/ bike/ traffic and courier safety. Timeline of service is important but safety is more important.
    - c) Peak pick-up/ delivery operations coincide with both the morning peak travel period and the lunchtime/ mid-day pedestrian peak period.
    - d) Very large buildings in Bethesda may require multiple trips between the delivery vehicle and building.
    - e) Limited curb space sometimes requires the delivery drivers to circle the block looking for parking.
    - f) Honda dealership-No Place to back in and load. Don't want to just park in front because it takes up space. Takes a while to find parking as well
  2. Technology
    - a) Autonomous vehicles do not work with the current delivery model.
    - b) "Smart Curb" (public loading zone reservation) technology is not currently used
  3. Typical Daily Operations
    - a) Drivers depart the Gaithersburg depot by 8:30 AM to make deliveries. The majority of pick-up/ delivery activities occur between 9:00 AM and 2:00 PM.
    - b) A second wave of drivers departs the depot at approximately 2:00 PM for afternoon parcel pick-up with the last drivers returning to the depot by 7:00 PM.
  4. How has the Pandemic affected delivery operations?
    - a) Higher package volume
    - b) Expanded café seating and road closures (to expand public spaces and promote social distancing) and expanded mobile pick-up spaces have made it more difficult to find parking and increased distances between the truck and delivery locations.

5. How local government can support delivery operations
  - a) Designated delivery zones would be helpful.
    - a) Sufficient space is critical because peak operations fare the same across all carriers (i.e. whether UPS, FedEx, Amazon, or DHL, all drivers are out at the same time of day).
    - b) Adequate signage for loading areas
  - b) Accommodations for delivery operations would be appreciated. FedEx representatives gave examples of receiving tickets and having their vehicles immobilized through the use of “wheel boots.”
    - a) Parking tickets don’t really change driver behavior because the drivers aren’t responsible for the fines.
6. What practices in other jurisdictions have been successful in managing delivery access?
  - a) Use of designated curbside loading zones in Frederick County, MD.
7. Additional comments:
  - a) Is interested in the educational component of loading practices that could be offered by the police department



Amazon

**March 8, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden, Leslye Howerton  
Attendees: Jeff Cleland, Manager, State Transportation Public Policy  
Broderick Green, Senior Manager - Economic Development  
Samantha Mazo, Sr. Project Manager, Real Estate Amazon Last Mile Network

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. Urban Delivery Issues/ typical daily operations
    - a) The biggest challenges facing delivery operations in Bethesda is the competition for curb space, given the desire to be as close to the final point of delivery as possible, and consumer expectations for timely delivery.
    - b) Loading accommodation in urban downtowns is generally geared toward restaurant/ commercial uses and does not necessarily accommodate ecommerce delivery.
    - c) Amazon tries to use the “right” vehicle for the job – in urban areas, this means using Sprinter vans, step vans, and in some cases, flex driver vehicles (personal vehicles).
    - d) Drivers typically depart the local delivery station (located on E. Gude Drive) at approximately 10:30 AM to avoid impacts to the road network during the peak period.
  2. Technology/ alternative delivery methods
    - a) Amazon has some experience with smart curb applications, such as Curb LR in New York City. In practice, this type of technology has limitations because it is not in widespread use and can be an impediment to deliveries.
    - b) Amazon uses their own software, “Rabbit,” to scan and track packages
    - c) Amazon Hub Locker + (Storefront) – offers an alternative pick-up/ return location. An example of this service is in College Park at 4200 Guilford Drive, College Park, MD, 20740
    - d) Amazon lockers are used in locations where there is a demand for that service.
      - a) Considerations for implementing Amazon lockers include high rates of “porch piracy,” demand for the service, and space to located the lockers (private property agreements)
    - e) Amazon has limited pilot programs with autonomous vehicles (Amazon Scout) on suburban sidewalks. There are limitations with this technology, particularly on urban sidewalks with lots of people and street furniture. Autonomous vehicles do not appear to be a near-term solution for urban deliveries. Amazon Scout has a local pilot in Tenleytown, DC.

- f) In the Manhattan and Brooklyn markets, Amazon has a cargo bike delivery system. This mode of delivery operates out of Whole Foods locations and is primarily oriented toward grocery delivery.
  - a) Approximately 360 bikes as part of the Amazon fleet
  - b) Considerations for implementing bicycle delivery include the delivery density, safety, and adequacy of bike infrastructure.
- 3. Effective Practices in other jurisdictions
  - a) Use of delivery zones along the curb
- 4. How local government can support your operations
  - a) ?

Maryland Department of Transportation  
**March 9, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden  
Attendees: Michelle Martin, Deputy Director at Maryland Department of Transportation  
Meredith Hill, Chief, MDSHA Innovative Planning & Performance Division  
Nicole Katsikides, PhD, Research Scientist, Texas A&M Transportation Institute  
Darren Bean, Assistant Regional Planner – Montgomery County, RIPD MDSHA  
Gregory Grant, Transit Planner, MTA  
Kandese Holford, Asst. Chief RIPD & Statewide Bicycle/Pedestrian Coordinator  
Jamie Richardson, Transit Engineer/Planner, MTA

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. Maryland State Freight Plan Update
    - a) MDOT recently kicked-off a multi-year update to the State Freight Plan and expects to deliver a completed plan in the fall of 2022.
    - b) The goal of the State Freight Plan will be to update the goals, objectives, and programs of the existing plan.
    - c) The study will focus on statewide initiatives and will not get to the municipal level of detail.
    - d) Additional information is available on the MDOT website at: [www.mdot.maryland.gov/freight](http://www.mdot.maryland.gov/freight)
  2. Truck Routes
    - a) An opportunity to further research following the Urban Loading and Delivery Management Study would be to update the Countywide truck routes/ restrictions map
    - b) Baltimore recently updated the City's truck route map and used citizen/ technical stakeholder advisory meetings to identify operators preferred routes (for efficiency) and residential neighborhoods that need to be protected from non-local truck traffic.
    - c) Baltimore uses a camera enforcement system for truck routes that automatically issue tickets based on the size and weight of vehicles.
  3. Urban Delivery Issues/ Best Practices
    - a) Work with delivery service providers to reduce time spent on the curb through the provision of parcel lockers or encouraging the use of GPS-based delivery routing technology. An example of both the GPS-routing technology and use of common curbside loading zones can be found in Seattle, WA.
    - b) Provide adequate curb space on urban blocks for loading operations
    - c) The City of Baltimore uses loading zones. Installation of these zones seems to be based on request by adjacent businesses.
    - d) Urban consolidation centers, in use in Europe and Japan, have been effective in managing the size and quantity of delivery vehicles present in urban downtowns.

4. Technology/ Data
  - a) The State has had some success with a crowdsourced parking/ loading violation tool associated with the implementation of new bike and transit lanes. This tool allows private citizens to report/ document issues observed in the new bike/ transit lanes and has provided useful information for MDOT staff. Known problem areas can be targeted for intervention/ enforcement, as needed. The interface has been through an intuitive website.
  - b) MDOT recently undertook a Statewide study of truck parking locations, based on Inrix data, that may be available for use in the Urban Loading and Delivery Management Study.
5. Equity
  - a) The group discussed how the Study will address equity issues. Planning Staff explained that although this is a very technical study, any recommendations would be considered through an equity lens. Specifically, outreach completed for the study sought to include a wide variety of stakeholders and recommendations would be considered based on minimal impacts to small business and accessibility.
6. Additional Information
  - a) MDOT 2020 Truck Parking Study  
<https://www.mdot.maryland.gov/tso/pages/Index.aspx?PageId=80>
  - b) Consider coordinating with staff with the MDOT Motor Carrier Division.
  - c) Check availability of truck parking analysis data from MDOT

Bethesda Transportation Demand Management District  
Advisory Committee  
**March 19, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden. Iftin Thompson

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. Suggestion for additional outreach: members of the ADA community:
    - The DC Achilles chapter seeks to empower athletes with disabilities to participate in mainstream running events in order to promote person achievement.
  2. Known Issues:
    - a) Arlington Road near Euro Motorcars is a persistent problem.
    - b) Compliance with bike lanes (vehicles parked in the lanes) is a problem
  3. Examples of effective loading operations:
    - a) 7501 Wisconsin Avenue – site access and circulation is very well organized and the site is served by both a layby and private alley.
    - b) The Adagio (Wisconsin Avenue/ Bradley Boulevard) works well given the design of the loading docks and garage access points.
    - c) Trader Joes/ Mini Target (Wisconsin Ave/ Stanford St) – high volume of deliveries, good traffic management on site.
  4. Suggestions to improve existing operations/ considerations for the Study:
    - a) Commercial properties/ delivery companies need to have someone present to help trucks back into loading docks.
    - b) There need to be designated spaces on the street to accommodate loading demands.
    - c) Time of day restrictions on loading should be considered when taking into account noise impacts on the residential properties in downtown and adjacent street traffic demands.
    - d) The Study should:
      - a) recommend solutions that can be retrofitted into existing streets.
      - b) Recommend solutions that are practical and enforceable
  5. Pandemic-related accommodations that should be considered for future use:
    - a) Curbside pick-up/ loading zones have been very effective in managing loading demand.

**March 29, 2021**

Staff: Matthew Folden and Iftin Thompson  
Attendees: Brian Crist, Property Manager

Discussion:

- Planning Staff presented the Urban Loading Study Scope of Work presentation and solicited feedback.
- Discussion points raised during the meeting included:
  1. Mail delivery:
    - 150 packages per day – UPS and FedEx
      - a) Package deliveries have increased since the start of the pandemic
      - b) Sometimes UPS comes 2 or 3 times in a day with a full truck load.
    - Package room exists right next to the concierge
    - Amazon locker coming in the next few months. Most likely in the next 2 months
      - a) Deliveries may take longer because the driver will now need to leave packages in the specific lockers rather than just with the concierge
      - b) Lockers will not allow oversized packages to be delivered. Residents will need to request loading docks to receive large packages
    - Deliveries are hard to schedule UPS is consistent, FedEx doesn't even come every day
    - Drivers usually stop along Wisconsin Ave to deliver packages
  2. Loading Dock
    - The loading dock is a long walk from the front desk and it's difficult to enforce delivery drivers to park in dock
    - Loading dock scheduling 8A-6P for resident move-in/move-outs
      - a) Residents usually utilize U-hauls to move-in, but on occasion have paid people to deliver things.
      - b) Some residents, mostly military, have requested to use PODS but this is an issue because PODS can't be accommodated at this location. Military will usually have to use larger trucks
      - c) Lease-up period has weekends with 20+ move-ins
    - Harris Teeter uses the same dock with a different slip
      - a) The grocery runs it themselves and doesn't really work with manager.
      - b) No issues with Harris Teeter deliveries
    - Trash pick-up happens MWF: Grounds people roll out bins for trash service to pick-up
  3. Known issues
    - Mail/parcel delivery blocking street traffic
    - Loading dock conflicts: Trash pick-up during move-ins/move-outs

4. Suggestions to improve issues
  - Trash and loading needs to be separate from one another due to operational conflicts with trash service and moving. It also needs to be separate from grocery store due to smell
    - a) The Department can support by encouraging good design to separate trash and loading
  - Designated loading areas
    - a) Preferably on Wisconsin Ave given present day demand
    - b) Unsure of how a designated loading area could be managed
5. Additional Comments
  - Loading and delivery has been consistent since the Pandemic
  - Food deliveries have increased since pandemic. About 10 to 20 food deliveries a day

City of Fredrick Parking Department  
***April 6, 2021***

Staff: Matthew Folden, Iftin Thompson

Attendees: Steve Johnson, City of Fredrick Supervisor for Parking

Discussion points raised during the meeting included:

1. Enforcement:
  - a. Needs to be coordinated with loading zones
  - b. The City issues \$75 tickets for loading violations
  - c. City does not have police doing enforcement
  - d. The parking department has the enforcement authority on loading
2. Outreach to stakeholders:
  - a. Critical to build relationships with the community and business owners
    - i. What do they need and at what time?
    - ii. What are the traffic demands on the adjacent streets?
3. Additional Comments:
  - a. Provides 20-minute Loading zone passes – two to every business
  - b. Keep loading clean and simple
  - c. Very difficult to limit delivery times and overnight deliveries are problematic – both because of noise disruptions and because the businesses are closed.
  - d. Uber/ lyft tends to occur in the highest volume at night – off peak. Has not been a problem to this point.
  - e. Place loading based on the establishments needs
  - f. Signage is important and needs to be clear
  - g. The Department went block by block and evenly distributed loading areas
  - h. Short term loading is 6AM – 10AM
  - i. Long term loading is 6AM – 5PM
  - j. The City has a recent study on loading